State and Local Government Workforce: 2016 Trends

Recruiting and retaining qualified personnel (92 percent), succession planning (80 percent), and staff development (79 percent) are ranked as the most important issues for the second year in a row by state and local government human resources managers. Governments continue to have difficulty recruiting for a range of positions, including finance, IT, skilled trades, and public safety. The skill sets they most need in new hires are interpersonal, technology, and written communication skills.

Hiring is a growing trend. The percentage of governments hiring has increased to 77 percent in 2016, an increase from 27 percent in 2013, 66 percent in 2014, and 73 percent in 2015. For this year’s survey, 41 percent report hiring contract and temporary workers.

Governments are experiencing an uptick in retirements. Fifty-four percent (54 percent) of respondents report that retirements were higher in 2015 than in 2014. Twenty-one (21 percent) of retirement-eligible employees are delaying their retirements, a notable decline from a rate of 46 percent in 2009.

Twenty-one (21 percent) of respondents’ governments made changes to their retirement benefits over the past year and 52 percent made changes to health benefits. Offering a competitive compensation package was rated as important by 69 percent of respondents and 85 percent report that their benefits are competitive with the labor market.

A majority of respondents report that their governments offer flexible schedules (59 percent) or flexible hours (51 percent) and 22 percent offer regular telecommuting for eligible employees.

This report reflects the survey responses of members¹ of the International Public Management Association for Human Resources (ipma-hr.org) and National Association of State Personnel Executives (naspe.net). The online survey was conducted from March 15 to April 7, 2016 by the Center for State and Local Government Excellence (slge.org) with 331 members submitting responses.

Participants

1) You work for…(n = 330)²:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State government</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local government</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal government</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² (n = number of respondents to each question)

Workforce Changes

2) Which of the following workforce changes has your government implemented over the past year? (n = 331)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hired employees</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract or temporary</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broad-based pay increases</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narrow, position-specific</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No change</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hiring freezes</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pay Freezes</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Layoffs</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early retirement incentives</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furloughs</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹Sent to 3958 IPMA-HR and 120 NASPE members
²Sent to 3958 IPMA-HR and 120 NASPE members
3) In 2015 your government hired... (n = 330)

4) Regarding your government’s workforce separations...

5) What skill sets are most needed in new hires? (n = 323)

Note: “Other” skill sets offered were: verbal communication; analytical; administrative; emotional intelligence; innovative/adaptable/resourceful/resilient; leadership; politically savvy; customer service; collaborative; social/diversity awareness; business results; business acumen; critical thinking; good work ethic; coping skills.

6) What positions, if any, do you continue to have a hard time filling in the current economic climate? (n = 273)

- Accountants
- Building Inspectors
- Corrections Officers
- Dispatchers
- Engineers (all types)
- Finance (all types)
- Firefighters
- Information Technology Professionals
- Management (all levels)
- Mechanics
- Mental Health Professionals
- Nurses
- Physicians
- Police Officers
- Public Works
- Seasonal Employees
- Skilled Trades (all types)
- Social Workers
- Water Treatment Plant Occupations (all types)
Recruitment Practices

7) What recruitment practices are most successful in reaching qualified candidates? (n = 327)

- Online Job Advertising: 84%
- Government Web Sites: 50%
- Employee Referrals: 44%
- Social Media: 33%
- State/Local newsletters: 18%
- Job Fairs: 15%
- Conferences: 4%
- National Newsletters: 2%

Note: “Other” practices offered were: professional organizations/associations; presentations at schools; league of cities web site; newspapers; Federal Job Service Center; radio advertisements; university web sites and events; recruiters.

Retirement Plan Changes

9) Over the past year, has your government made any changes to the retirement benefits you offer to your employees? (n = 329)

- Yes: 21%
- No: 77%
- Don’t know: 2%

10) If your government has made changes to the retirement benefits, has it made any of the following changes to retirement benefits for new hires? (n = 264)

- Increased employee contributions to pension plans: 16%
- Increased pension eligibility requirements: 10%
- Other: 9%
- Increased employer contribution to pension plans: 6%
- Decreased pension benefits: 6%
- Replaced a defined benefit with a hybrid plan (combination of a DB and DC plan): 4%
- Reduced/eliminated cost of living adjustments: 4%
- Replaced a defined benefit with a defined contribution plan: 3%
- Decreased employer contributions to defined contribution plans: 3%

Note: “Other” changes offered were: instituted voluntary ROTH post-tax contributions; created new employee type (limited term with DC); reduced vesting period; increased vesting period; changed providers.

Postponed Retirements

8) What changes, if any, have your retirement-eligible employees made regarding their plans for retirement? (n = 329)

- Postponed their retirement date: 22%
- Accelerated their retirement date: 21%
- No changes: 41%
- Don’t know: 16%
11) **If your government has made changes to the retirement benefits, has it made any of the following changes to retirement benefits for current workers?** (n = 264)

![Bar chart showing retirement benefits changes]

- 13% Increased employee contributions to pension plans
- 6% Other
- 5% Increased employer contribution to pension plans
- 3% Increased pension eligibility requirements
- 3% Reduced/eliminated cost of living adjustments
- 2% Decreased pension benefits
- 1% Replaced a defined benefit with a defined contribution plan
- 1% Replaced a defined benefit with a hybrid plan (combination of a DB and DC plan)
- 1% Decreased employer contributions to defined contribution plans

Note: “Other” changes offered were: early retirement for public safety; changed providers; instituted voluntary ROTH post-tax contributions; lowered vesting requirements; implemented multi-tier system; added employer contribution outside of regular DB plan.

### Retirement Preparedness

12) **Do you feel your employees are prepared financially for their retirement?** (n = 329)

![Pie chart showing retirement preparedness]

- 38% Yes
- 42% No
- 20% Don’t know

14) **If your government has made changes to the health benefits, what changes?** (n = 268)

![Bar chart showing health care plan changes]

- 40% Shifted more health care costs from employer to employees (examples: higher premiums, co-payment, and deductibles)
- 28% Implemented wellness programs
- 15% Other
- 12% Shifted employees to high deductible plans with a health savings account
- 10% Implemented chronic care management programs
- 9% Shifted more health care costs from employer to retirees
- 7% Established a health reimbursement arrangement
- 4% Increased requirements (e.g., years to vest, age of eligibility, etc.) to qualify for retiree health benefits
- 3% Shifted retirees to high deductible plans with health savings account
- 3% Set funds aside to cover future retiree health benefit costs
- 2% Eliminated retiree health care
- 1% Shifted from a traditional retiree health care model to a defined contribution health care model (example: health savings plan) for new employees

Note: “Other” changes offered were: went partially self-funded; conducted a physician performance/cost analysis – employees pay lower co-payments at higher performing doctors; limited eligibility; implemented on-site medical clinic; added additional retiree health plan; implemented tobacco surcharge; changed carriers; changed network plan; increased contribution to FSA if employee signed up for family coverage; added tiered hospitalization plan; implemented spousal exclusion clause; increased employee OPEB contribution for new hires; moved to a municipality-owned, pooled, self-insured company; reduced number of plan options; increased number of plan options; increased contributions to HSA.
15) Has your government made changes to health benefits related to the Affordable Care Act? (n = 303)

Note: “Other” changes offered were: temporary staff no longer than 6 months; better defined part-time groups; aligned medical plans under one deductible; RX out of pocket maximum; lowered incentive to employees waiving medical coverage; provide coverage to greater portion of employee population; increased notification of health care benefit options to employees without automatic health care options; offer health benefits to qualified temp employees.

17) Do you feel the benefits compensation you offer your employees is competitive with the labor market? (n = 330)

18) What flexible work practices does your organization offer? (n = 328)

Workforce Issues

16) Do you feel the total wage compensation you offer your employees is competitive with the labor market? (n = 330)

Note: “Other” flexible work practices offered were: work from alternative work locations; the ability to work different shifts.
19) Looking ahead, which workforce issues are important to your organization? (n = 330)
STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT WORKFORCE: 2016 TRENDS
Board Of Directors

Robert J. O’Neill, Chair
Executive Director, ICMA

Joan McCallen, Vice Chair
Former President and Chief Executive Officer, ICMA-RC

Eric A. Anderson
Vice President, GovHR USA, and retired city manager

Donald J. Borut
Former Executive Director, National League of Cities

Gregory J. Dyson
Senior Vice President and Chief Operations and Marketing Officer, ICMA-RC

Jeffrey L. Esser
Executive Director, Government Finance Officers Association

The Honorable William D. Euille
Founder, Principal, and CEO, The Euille Group; Former Mayor, City of Alexandria, Virginia

Peter A. Harkness
Founder and Publisher Emeritus, Governing Magazine

Scott D. Pattison
Executive Director and CEO, National Governors Association

William T. Pound
Executive Director, National Conference of State Legislatures

Antoinette A. Samuel
Deputy Executive Director, National League of Cities

Raymond C. Scheppach, PhD
Professor, University of Virginia Frank Batten School of Leadership and Public Policy; Former Executive Director, National Governors Association

SLGE Staff

Elizabeth K. Kellar
President and CEO

Joshua M. Franzel, PhD
Vice President, Research

Amber Snowden
Communications Manager

Bonnie J. Faulk
Operations Manager

The Center gratefully acknowledges the financial support from ICMA-RC to undertake this research project.
About the Center for State and Local Government Excellence

The Center for State and Local Government Excellence helps state and local governments become knowledgeable and competitive employers so they can attract and retain a talented and committed workforce. The Center identifies best practices and conducts research on competitive employment practices, workforce development, pensions, retiree health security, and financial planning. The Center also brings state and local leaders together with respected researchers and features the latest demographic data on the aging work force, research studies, and news on health care, recruitment, and succession planning on its web site, www.slge.org.

The Center's five research priorities are:

- Retirement plans and savings
- Retiree health care
- Financial education for employees
- Talent strategies and innovative employment practices
- Workforce development